

Compilation of Public Comments
Bayou Cocodrie/Chicot Lake/Cocodrie Lake System, Bayou Segnette, St. Charles Parish Canals, Bayou des Allemands, Bayou Verret, Bayou Chevreuil, Bayou Citamon, Grand Bayou TMDLs

Commenter	Date Received	Waterbody (ies)	Summary of Comments	Summary of LDEQ Response
C. A. "Buck" Vandersteen	2/9/2004	Bayou Cocodrie/Chicot Lake/Cocodrie Lake System	<p>August 1999 data are not representative or reliable due to drought because sediment oxygen demand (SOD) and biological oxygen demand (BOD) are unnaturally elevated from loose organic material/detritus intermittently washing into stream with little outflow. We request that LDEQ re-survey during normal conditions to develop a third revision of the TMDL.</p>	<p>While LDEQ understands and acknowledges the concern expressed at the conditions surrounding data collection for this TMDL, we were required to complete the TMDL according to the court-ordered schedule. LDEQ had no choice but to conduct the sampling during 1999 and 2000. Although these were dry years, the data collected were used to populate the TMDL models, representing critical conditions. These in-stream data produce a more accurate model than estimates and default values would produce.</p>
			<p>This TMDL should be set aside and a new one developed on representative data to achievable standards. The report states that reductions in natural non-point loadings will be necessary to achieve the dissolved oxygen (DO) standard for these segments. Since the report acknowledges that this cannot be done and that the DO standards cannot be met during all seasons, this violates the requirement that the TMDL be achievable and that the agency provide assurance that the standard can and will be met.</p>	<p>LDEQ understands your concerns about achievability of large reductions in nonpoint source loadings in these watersheds and will continue to pursue revisions to the water quality standards as needed, particularly in the DO standard. LDEQ revised the DO criterion for the upper reach of Bayou Cocodrie to 3.5 mg/L (summer) and 5.0 mg/L (winter) as reflected in this TMDL. LDEQ is planning additional monitoring to determine in-stream SOD in selected waterbodies draining watersheds of various land uses; this will provide more accurate estimates of SOD for the oxygen demand TMDL calculations.</p>
Charlie Van Hoof, CLECO	2/9/2004	Bayou Cocodrie/Chicot Lake/Cocodrie Lake System	<p>We request acknowledgement of Evangeline Power Station as a <i>de minimis</i> discharger of BOD in the final revised TMDL, and exclusion of the Evangeline Power Station from modeling /TMDL wasteload allocation because its small BOD loading of 0.0035 million gallons per day from treated sanitary wastewater does not result in measurable impact.</p>	<p>LDEQ acknowledges your comments and revised the report to reflect your comments regarding the CLECO discharge.</p>

Commenter	Date Received	Waterbody (ies)	Summary of Comments	Summary of LDEQ Response
Marnie Winter, Jefferson Parish	3/3/2004	Bayou Segnette, Subsegment 020701	<p>Bayou Segnette, Subsegment 020701 should be designated as estuarine and its dissolved oxygen (DO) standard should be lowered to 4.0 mg/L or less.</p>	<p>LDEQ agrees that the current DO standard of 5 mg/L is not appropriate for many of Louisiana's sluggish bayous and man-made canals and has been working toward establishing more appropriate standards for many of the state's water-ways. Revision of an existing standard requires a use attainability analysis, and U.S. EPA approval has been a difficult process. LDEQ continues to work toward this goal and will target Bayou Segnette for a standard revision. When the revised DO standard is approved, we will revise the TMDL accordingly and make the revised TMDL available for public review again.</p>
			<p>The TMDL should be reevaluated because the 3 million gallon per day Westwego wastewater treatment plant is located just outside the subsegment but discharges into it and was omitted from calculation of TMDL from point sources. Instead, it was in the calculation of TMDL from manmade nonpoint sources.</p>	<p>LDEQ will reevaluate the Westwego Wastewater Treatment Plant loading in the TMDL model to determine whether this should be treated as a point source to Bayou Segnette and the model re-run.</p>
			<p>Bayou Segnette Pumping Station was listed as a point source discharging to Bayou Segnette, but LDEQ was notified via the 6/6/03 discharge monitoring report that sanitary wastewater was rerouted to the City of Westwego's Sanitary Sewerage System in April 2002 and does not discharge into Bayou Segnette.</p>	<p>Acknowledged.</p>

Commenter	Date Received	Waterbody (ies)	Summary of Comments	Summary of LDEQ Response
Marnie Winter, Jefferson Parish	3/3/2004	Bayou Segnette, Subsegment 020701	<p>Water quality data collected by the U.S. Geological Survey from 1981-1991 are no longer valid because Jefferson Parish consolidated sewage treatment plants in 1988 and rerouted discharge to the Mississippi River. Millaudon Canal dissolved oxygen (DO), which was the worst of the five stations in the Bayou Segnette subsegment, should be much improved since the Marrero wastewater treatment plant no longer discharges into the storm drainage system.</p>	<p>LDEQ strives to ensure that all of its TMDLs are scientifically sound and defensible. We have dedicated a staff of approximately 20 to the collection of intensive survey data needed to develop the TMDLs. All of the field measurements and samples are collected in accordance with LDEQ's established standard operating procedures and quality assurance project plans. In addition, we have established modeling tools and protocols that include Louisiana-specific coefficients and equations that more accurately reflect conditions in Louisiana waterbodies. As we expand our database and knowledge of Louisiana waters, we will make adjustments to further improve the accuracy of our TMDL models. The LDEQ is committed to producing scientifically sound TMDLs because we understand the impact that TMDLs can have on the regulated community.</p>
			<p>Because of the complex nature of this subsegment with its levee protection/forced pumping system, Jefferson Parish suggests the use of Calibrated/Verified Model instead of Calibrated Model.</p>	<p>Same as above</p>
			<p>Jefferson Parish wants assurance that the proposed TMDL was based on sound science and reliable data that stand up to standard quality assurance/quality control. We have implemented many programs and best management practices to improve storm water quality from our drainage pump stations.</p>	<p>Same as above</p>
Vicki Murillo, Gulf Restoration Network	2/26/2004	St. Charles Parish Canals, Subsegment 020501	<p>TMDL does not describe best management practices (BMPs) for manmade nonpoint source reductions and does not establish a timeframe for implementation. TMDL does not describe how wastewater discharge permits and BMPs will improve water quality in Subsegment 020501. Nonpoint source reductions are unrealistic, and there are no reasonable assurances that these reductions will be achieved.</p>	<p>At this time, an implementation plan is not a mandatory component of a TMDL. LDEQ has recently revised its Nonpoint Source Management Plan (Section 319 Plan) and U.S. EPA has approved it. As TMDLs are approved, more detailed strategies specific to individual watersheds will be developed outlining the steps that will be taken to implement management measures in those watersheds to address all of their man-induced nonpoint sources. Following completion and approval of the TMDLs for Barataria Basin watersheds, LDEQ will begin developing</p>

				implementation plans for these watersheds. Reasonable assurances from LDEQ for achievement of stated manmade nonpoint source reduction goals include the fact that EPA has awarded approximately \$2 million of Section 319 grant funds to LDEQ each year for implementation of BMPs/nonpoint source control projects.
Vicki Murillo, Gulf Restoration Network	2/26/2004	St. Charles Parish Canals, Subsegment 020501	LDEQ's load scenarios to meet the current 5 mg/L dissolved oxygen (DO) standard are unrealistic. No-load scenarios indicate a DO standard less than 5 mg/L. LDEQ speculates considerable natural nonpoint oxygen demand based on experience in Barataria basin, but no data are presented to support this assumption, and none of the relevant reference streams for estimating background loads are near the subsegment or even in Barataria basin. Accuracy of the natural background load estimate is questionable. Dissolved oxygen (DO) standards adjustment resulting from questionable background load estimates could lead to acceptance of continued impairment.	While it is true that the streams mentioned and utilized as reference streams in this TMDL are not located in the Barataria Basin, these are the best reference streams currently available. LDEQ has not yet identified or sampled pristine reference streams in the coastal ecological regions of the state. LDEQ is continuing to sample reference streams in order to expand our reference database for use in water quality standards and TMDL development.
			LDEQ needs to clearly state how the Margin of Safety (MOS) is derived; a site-specific approach for MOSs is suggested.	LDEQ has employed an explicit 20% MOS in most of its TMDLs as a "standard" MOS, which is considered to be inclusive of both a margin of error and a growth factor, as described in LDEQ's Continuing Planning Process. LDEQ has utilized a site-specific approach in TMDL development, and, when appropriate, has utilized a MOS that is either greater than or less than 20%, depending on trends in population and land use changes in the watershed. All of LDEQ's TMDLs also include an implicit, undetermined MOS related to the various conservative assumptions in the TMDL calculations.

Committer	Date Received	Waterbody (ies)	Summary of Comments	Summary of LDEQ Response
Vicki Murillo, Gulf Restoration Network	3/9/2004	Bayou des Allemands (Subsegment 020301)	<p>TMDL does not describe best management practices (BMPs) for manmade nonpoint source reductions and does not establish a timeframe for implementation. TMDL does not describe how wastewater discharge permits and BMPs will improve water quality in Subsegment 020301. Nonpoint source reductions are unrealistic, and there are no reasonable assurances that these reductions will be achieved.</p>	<p>At this time, an implementation plan is not a mandatory component of a TMDL. LDEQ has recently revised its Nonpoint Source Management Plan (Section 319 Plan) and U.S. EPA has approved it. As TMDLs are approved, more detailed strategies specific to individual watersheds will be developed outlining the steps that will be taken to implement management measures in those watersheds to address all of their man-induced nonpoint sources. Following completion and approval of the TMDLs for Barataria Basin watersheds, LDEQ will begin developing implementation plans for these watersheds. Reasonable assurances from LDEQ for achievement of stated manmade nonpoint source reduction goals include the fact that EPA has awarded approximately \$2 million of Section 319 grant funds to LDEQ each year for implementation of BMPs/nonpoint source control projects.</p>
			<p>This TMDL calls for reductions in biological oxygen demand (BOD) loads only during the summer. Are there new data to indicate that low dissolved oxygen (DO) is no longer a problem in Bayou des Allemands during the winter? We are concerned that a lack of reduction in the winter season will result in continued impairment.</p>	<p>Based upon the data collected in Bayou des Allemands, the water quality simulation model projects that the DO criterion will be met in the winter months. In most cases, the TMDL reductions would be implemented throughout the year.</p>
			<p>LDEQ's load scenarios to meet the current 5 mg/L dissolved oxygen (DO) standard are unrealistic. No-load scenarios indicate a DO standard less than 5 mg/L. LDEQ speculates considerable natural nonpoint oxygen demand based on experience in Barataria basin, but no data are presented to support this assumption, and none of the relevant reference streams for estimating background loads are near the subsegment or even in Barataria basin. Accuracy of the natural background load estimate is questionable. DO standards adjustment resulting from questionable background load estimates could lead to acceptance of continued impairment.</p>	<p>While it is true that the streams mentioned and utilized as reference streams in this TMDL are not located in the Barataria Basin, these are the best reference streams currently available. LDEQ has not yet identified or sampled pristine reference streams in the coastal ecological regions of the state. LDEQ is continuing to sample reference streams in order to expand our reference database for use in water quality standards and TMDL development.</p>

Commenter	Date Received	Waterbody (ies)	Summary of Comments	Summary of LDEQ Response
Vicki Murillo, Gulf Restoration Network	3/16/2004	Bayou Verret, Bayou Chevreuil, Bayou Citamon, Grand Bayou (Subsegment 020101)	<p>TMDL does not describe best management practices (BMPs) for manmade nonpoint source reductions and does not establish a timeframe for implementation; there is no description of a plan for reducing load allocations. TMDL does not describe how wastewater discharge permits and BMPs will improve water quality in Subsegment 020101. TMDL does not include reasonable assurances for achievement of stated manmade nonpoint source reduction goals.</p>	<p>At this time, an implementation plan is not a mandatory component of a TMDL. LDEQ has recently revised its Nonpoint Source Management Plan (Section 319 Plan) and U.S. EPA has approved it. As TMDLs are approved, more detailed strategies specific to individual watersheds will be developed outlining the steps that will be taken to implement management measures in those watersheds to address all of their man-induced nonpoint sources. Following completion and approval of the TMDLs for Barataria Basin watersheds, LDEQ will begin developing implementation plans for these watersheds. Reasonable assurances from LDEQ for achievement of stated manmade nonpoint source reduction goals include the fact that EPA has awarded approximately \$2 million of Section 319 grant funds to LDEQ each year for implementation of BMPs/nonpoint source control projects.</p>
			<p>LDEQ's load scenarios to meet the current 5 mg/L dissolved oxygen (DO) standard are unrealistic. No-load scenarios indicate a DO standard less than 5 mg/L. LDEQ speculates considerable natural nonpoint oxygen demand based on experience in Barataria basin, but no data is presented to support this assumption, and none of the relevant reference streams for estimating background loads are near the subsegment or even in Barataria basin. Accuracy of the natural background load estimate is questionable. DO standards adjustment resulting from questionable background load estimates could lead to acceptance of continued impairment.</p>	<p>While it is true that the streams mentioned and utilized as reference streams in this TMDL are not located in the Barataria Basin, these are the best reference streams currently available. LDEQ has not yet identified or sampled pristine reference streams in the coastal ecological regions of the state. LDEQ is continuing to sample reference streams in order to expand our reference database for use in water quality standards and TMDL development.</p>

Commenter	Date Received	Waterbody (ies)	Summary of Comments	Summary of LDEQ Response
Vicki Murillo, Gulf Restoration Network	3/16/2004	Bayou Verret, Bayou Chevreuil, Bayou Citamon, Grand Bayou (Subsegment 020101)	LDEQ needs to clearly state how the Margin of Safety (MOS) is derived; a site-specific approach for MOSs is suggested.	LDEQ has employed an explicit 20% MOS in most of its TMDLs as a “standard” MOS, which is considered to be inclusive of both a margin of error and a growth factor, as described in LDEQ’s Continuing Planning Process. LDEQ has utilized a site-specific approach in TMDL development, and, when appropriate, has utilized a MOS that is either greater than or less than 20%, depending on trends in population and land use changes in the watershed. All of LDEQ’s TMDLs also include an implicit, undetermined MOS related to the various conservative assumptions in the TMDL calculations.